

April 2023: CARB Quarterly TAC Report

Consultations¹

The California Air Resources Board (CARB) reaffirms that collaboration and input from California Native American Tribes through consultation on CARB rules, regulations, policies, and programs, helps CARB advance decisions and policies that better protect California’s air and the climate. CARB recognizes our parallel relationship to the people we serve, and values tribes’ traditional ecological knowledge and historic experience with managing California’s air and climate resources since time immemorial.

Consultations initiated during Q1

AB 52: Zero.

AB 926/Executive Order B-10-11: Zero.

Consultations closed during Q1 - 2

Open consultation topics and projects include: Zero

Overview Total Q1 Consultations	
AB52	0
B10-11/AB 926	0
Totals	0

Cap-and-Trade Forest Offset Projects

As of **Q1**, CARB issued a total of **199.4** million forest offset credits pursuant to the U.S. Forest Projects Protocol. Of that, **88.9** million credits were issued to Tribal entities and Alaska Native Corporations for improved forest management.

No other tribes entered the program as of **Q1**. As of this reporting period, the following Tribes and Alaska Native Corporations are participating in CARB’s program:

Tribe	Project Type
The Yurok Tribe (CA)	Yurok Tribe/Forest Carbon Partners CKGG Improved Forest Management Project (CAFR5011) Phase 1 (CAFR5090/CAFR0064)

¹ CARB met with tribes relating to various projects, grants, regulations, and inquiries. However, only government-to-government consultations are included in this section with high levels of government (Chair/Chief or Chairperson). Therefore, this section does not capture the many meetings where CARB engaged with tribes.

	Kepel Creek Improved Forest Management Project (CAFR5377)
Round Valley Indian Tribes (CA)	Round Valley Indian Tribes Improved Forest Management Project (CAFR5028)
Passamaquoddy Joint Tribal Council (ME)	Finite Carbon - Passamaquoddy Tribe IFM (CAFR5195)
White Mountain Apache Tribe (AZ)	White Mountain Apache Tribe Forest Carbon Project (CAFR5072) White Mountain Apache Tribe Carbon Project II (CAFR5253)
Confederated Tribes of the Warm Springs Reservation of Oregon (OR)	Warm Springs Phase I (CAFR5214)
The Confederated Tribes of the Colville Reservation (WA)	Finite Carbon - Colville IFM (CAFR5225)
Mescalero Apache Tribe (NM)	Forest Carbon Partners - Mescalero Apache Tribe Improved Forest Management Project (CAFR5283)
Spokane Tribe of Indians (WA)	Finite Carbon - Spokane Tribe of Indians IFM (CAFR6314)
Ahtna Incorporated (AK)	Finite Carbon - Ahtna Native Alaskan IFM (CAFR5360)
Haida Corporation (AK)	Bluesource - Haida Improved Forest Management Project (CAFR5458)
Port Graham Corporation (AK)	Forest Carbon Partners - Port Graham Corporation Improved Forest Management Project (CAFR5361)
Chugach Alaska Corporation (AK)	Chugach Alaska Forest Carbon Project (CAFR5364)
Goldbelt, Inc. (AK)	Bluesource - Goldbelt Improved Forest Management Project (CAFR5425)
Huna Totem Corporation (AK)	Finite Carbon – Huna Totem Native Alaskan IFM (CAFR5428)
Sealaska Corporation (AK)	Finite Carbon – Sealaska Native Alaskan IFM (CAFR5294)

	Finite Carbon – Sealaska 2 Native Alaskan IFM (CAFR5420)
Seldovia Native Association, Inc. (AK)	Forest Carbon Partners – Seldovia Native Association Forest Carbon Project (CAFR5382)
The English Bay Corporation (AK)	Forest Carbon Partners – English Bay Corporation Forest Carbon Project (CAFR5384)
Beach People, LLC (AK)	Finite Carbon – Tyonek Native Alaskan IFM (CAFR5413)

Funding Projects and Opportunities

Below are select funding programs that provide opportunities for tribes to receive funding to do various projects, such as funding zero emission vehicles, installing air quality monitors, air quality education, and outreach, to name a few.

Highlighted Funding Programs	What's funded	Link
AB 617 Community Air Grants	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Community engagement and outreach related to AB 617 Hiring consultants and/or technical experts Travel and logistical support for hosting and/or attending meetings related to AB 617 (i.e., room rental, meeting facilitation, transportation) Support for community operated air monitoring Data collection and analysis, including community based participatory research projects 	Link
Low Carbon Transportation	<p>Low Carbon Transportation Investments and the Air Quality Improvement Program provide mobile source incentives to reduce greenhouse gas, criteria pollutant, and toxic air contaminant emissions through the deployment of advanced technology and clean transportation, which can include but is not limited to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Zero-emission drayage truck and infrastructure pilot project Capture and control system for oil tanker projects 	Link

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sustainable transportation equity project (STEP) • Hybrid and zero-emission truck and bus voucher incentive projects • Electric bicycle incentive projects 	
Incentives	<p>Financial incentives are a key part of California's efforts to ensure cleaner cars, trucks, equipment and facilities are operating in our neighborhoods. Incentives help drive the development of new, cleaner technologies and, by speeding up their sale and adoption, help clean up the air. A few are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • California Climate Investments • Clean Vehicle Rebates • Hybrid & Zero-Emission Truck and Bus Vouchers • Clean Cars 4 All • Carl Moyer Air Quality Attainment Program • Funding Agricultural Replacement Measures for Emission Reductions (FARMER) Program • Enhanced Fleet Modernization Program • Community Air Protection Incentives • CARB also provides incentives to homeowners to replace old, polluting stoves with the Woodsmoke Reduction program. 	Link
Supplemental Environmental Projects (SEPs)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Community outreach and engagement • Pollution prevention or reduction (e.g., vegetative barriers, installation of air filtration systems) • Community monitoring • Trans-boundary projects 	Link
Regional Early Action Planning Grants of 2021 (REAP 2.0)	<p>REAP 2.0 will provide \$30 million in funding to Tribal and Rural Entities for Transformative Planning and Implementation Activities that meet Housing and equity goals and reduce Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT) Per Capita. HCD is the administrator of REAP 2.0 and CARB, as a collaborative state agency partner, has supported HCD with technical questions regarding REAP 2.0 specific to VMT reduction in rural/tribal areas.</p>	

As of **Q1**, CARB has funded, or is in the process of funding, **19 tribal projects**, totaling **\$4,581,803.00** to date. These tribal projects are identified below.

Program	Tribe	Project	Description	Amount
CMO	Big Pine Paiute Tribe of the Owens Valley	Community Transportation Needs	Engagement and outreach to the community groups and members using a variety of data collection techniques, such as one-on-one and group phone interviews, paper surveys, demonstration, and phone-in hotline	\$50,000
CMO	Twenty-Nine Palms Band of Mission Indians	On-Demand Electric Vehicle Service	Launch of carshare program with eight electric vehicles, four Level 2 charging stations and one Level 3 DC Fast Charger	\$993,300
CMO	Cahuilla Band of Indians	Clean Mobility Project	Implementation zero-emission carsharing program, which will provide residents with six electric plug-in vehicles	\$1,000,000
CMO	Paskenta Band of Nomlaki Indians	Mobility Needs Assessment	Engagement and outreach to community groups throughout the needs assessment process using a variety of data collection techniques, such as virtual surveys, telephonic interviews, and listening circles	\$50,000
CMO	Big Pine Paiute Tribe of the Owens Valley	Community Transportation Needs	Engagement and outreach to the community groups and members using a variety of data collection techniques, such as one-on-one and group phone interviews, paper surveys, demonstration, and phone-in hotline	\$50,000

CMO	Native American Environmental Protection Coalition (NAEPC)	Mobility Project Needs Assessment	Engagement and outreach with community groups and community members using a variety of culturally appropriate methods, such as community events, in-person or one-on-one interviews, and educational forums, and sessions with tribal leaders to collect information about travel needs	\$50,000
AB 617	Big Pine Paiute Tribe of the Owens Valley	Technical	Expansion of existing monitoring plan to fill in gaps in the local air monitoring networks, both tribal and that of the Great Basin Unified Air Pollution Control District	\$102,933
AB 617	Pala Band of Mission Indians	Technical	Launch community-scale air quality monitoring network to expand current monitoring with the deployment of six low-cost air quality sensors (Alphasense) to monitor for NO ₂ , O ₃ , PM _{2.5} , and PM ₁₀ at the reservation, or at neighboring tribal reservations, in collaboration with those tribes	\$281,189
AB 617	Twenty-Nine Palms Band of Mission Indians	Technical	Placement of new air quality PM ₁₀ /PM _{2.5} monitoring station at the Cabazon Tribal Government complex, where it will have surveillance coverage and accessibility for routine maintenance. The data collected from the station will be shared online, and the tribe will conduct	\$345,315

			community outreach on a quarterly basis to share air quality data collected and teach residents how to access the data and sign-up for alerts	
AB 617	Twenty-Nine Palms Band of Mission Indians	Technical	Continue the tribe's air monitoring efforts as the Quantification Settlement Agreement begins to be implemented and will continue sharing real-time air quality data with the community. This project will also continue to facilitate acquisition of publicly available, regulatory-quality air data. This data may be used to inform community air management decisions in the future and accurately assess the changes in air quality due to the receding Salton Sea	\$203,362
AB 617	Morongongo Band of Mission Indians	Technical	Five low-cost air quality monitors will be installed in strategic locations on the Reservation. Most of them will be in undeveloped, open space, adjacent to the Morongongo Community area. Due to the remote monitoring locations, these sensors will be configured with solar power	\$159,596
AB 617	Santa Ynez Band of Chumash Indians	Technical	Establish real-time monitoring network, strategic air quality sampling, community engagement and education, and tribal capacity building	\$177,101

AB 617	Blue Lake Rancheria	Educational	Creation of educational project to bring hands-on air quality monitoring and curriculum to tribal elementary, with focused AB 617 information and serve priority populations	\$98,334
AB 617	Twenty-Nine Palms Band of Mission Indians	Technical	Collect regulatory air quality monitoring data, capacity building through additional training, determine whether air quality mitigation projects implemented at the Salton Sea are effective in protecting public health, and provide to the community on an ongoing real-time, easily accessible format that can be directly utilized to make personal health decisions	\$216,105
AB 617	Morongo Band of Mission Indians	Educational	Enhance the community air monitoring currently being conducted by the tribe by extending monitoring efforts and supplementing community outreach and education efforts, and includes additional Quality Assurance Project Planning, community engagement, and data analysis activities, support air quality awareness and educational presentations and materials	\$100,000
AB 617	Blue Lake Rancheria	Technical	The project will provide the community with a PM air monitoring network, educational materials about PM air quality in general and during woodsmoke and wildland	\$300,000

			fire events, and extensive capacity building, educational materials, training on smoke events	
AB 617	Paskenta Band of Nomlaki Indians	Technical	This project will develop an air monitoring network for the tribal community to raise awareness of air quality issues stemming from wildfire and other pollution sources, deploy 4 multiple air monitors that will detect ozone, nitrogen dioxide, PM2.5 and 10, and send data in real-time to a website available for the Tribal community and other local non-tribal residents and to be shared	\$165,792
AB 617	Soboba Band of Luiseno Indians	Technical	Capacity building for the tribe to monitor air quality on its Reservation, develop a monitoring system air using low-cost sensors that continuously detect pollutants that are affecting the Tribal community, website development to display air quality data in real-time with statistics and analytical tools to help develop a baseline assessment of air quality, training workshops on technical and policy elements related to air quality monitoring, educational materials	\$197,776
SEP	La Jolla Band of Luiseño Indians	Technical	Purchase of necessary equipment for reporting ozone and PM2.5 Air Quality Index (AQI) values to the tribal community in	\$41,000

			real-time. Notifying the tribal community, in real-time, of “bad” air quality days due to PM2.5 and ozone will help the community, especially those suffering from respiratory issues, reduce exposure	
--	--	--	--	--

Engagement Opportunities

CARB’s Tribal Program began engaging tribes to ensure they know what CARB is doing. Specifically, CARB sent out the listserv notices to all tribes on the listserv and added select information on the Tribal Relations website. Specifically, CARB provides notice to all tribes every month for the Board hearing agenda, and provides notice on matters that may interest tribes, such as grants, supplemental environmental projects, Cap-and-Trade, the Scoping Plan, and State Implementation Plans, among others.

2023 Prescribed Fire Smoke Management Workshops: CARB Tribal Liaison coordinated tribal participation in the workshops held in Redding and Riverside in March 2023. Tribal panelists from the Hoopa Valley Tribe, Karuk Tribe and Pala Band of Mission Indians, highlighted the importance of prescribed and cultural burning to training participants, both virtually and in person. This training was provided to review achievements related to the prescribed fire smoke management program and included program updates from CAPCOA, CALFIRE, USEPA, USFS, State Parks, Tribal Groups, and CARB (Public Outreach, Meteorology, Monitoring) and status updates on the Forest Data Hub, California Smoke Spotter, PFIRS upgrade, CALFIRE online permitting system and the monitoring program.

Scoping Plan

On December 15, 2022, the California Air Resources Board approved the final proposed 2022 Scoping Plan, a world-leading roadmap to address climate change that cuts greenhouse gas emissions by 85% and achieves carbon neutrality in 2045. The 2022 Scoping Plan provides a detailed sector-by-sector roadmap to guide the world’s fourth-largest economy away from its current

dependence on petroleum and fossil gas to clean and renewable energy resources and zero-emission vehicles.

The action by the Board finalized a process to develop the final plan that has been in the works for two years. This included dozens of public meetings, workshops, and presentations and two Board meetings with comments from hundreds of members of the public, stakeholders, community members and tribes.

The plan draws on and continues several successful climate programs currently in effect but also stresses the need to radically accelerate and increase their pace and scale. This includes the need for an accelerated target of a 48% reduction of greenhouse gas emissions below 1990 levels by the end of this decade. By 2045, this economy-wide shift away from fossil fuels seeks to:

- Reduce fossil fuel consumption (liquid petroleum) to less than one-tenth of what we use today – a 94% reduction in demand.
- Cut greenhouse gas emissions by 85% below 1990 levels
- Reduce smog-forming air pollution by 71%
- Create 4 million new jobs.
- Save Californians \$200 billion in health costs due to pollution in 2045

The plan also includes actions to capture and store carbon through the state's natural and working lands (including its forests) and calls upon a variety of mechanical approaches to remove and safely store carbon dioxide to address the remaining 15% of greenhouse gas emissions that will remain in 2045 after the stringent direct reductions from every regulated source.

CARB developed AB 32 sources modeling scenarios and natural working lands management modeling scenarios with extensive input from sister agencies, the Environmental Justice Advisory Committee, tribes, and the public to illustrate the effectiveness of different pathways for achieving the state's climate goals. CARB specifically held a tribe only webinar to consider the map of tribal land ownership and land management modeling on September 17, 2021. The greenhouse gas emissions results from these scenarios were presented at a [public workshop](#) on March 15, 2022.

The first Board Hearing on the Update to the Scoping Plan was held on June 23, 2022. CARB engaged in outreach to request tribal consultation on the Scoping Plan. The outreach included the following:

- CARB sent AB 52 letters sent to tribes requesting notice in July 2021 for the "Notice of Preparation of Draft Substitute Environmental Document."

- CARB sent AB 52 letters sent to tribes requesting notice in May 2022 for the “Notice of Preparation of Draft Environmental Analysis and Opportunity to Comment under CEQA.”
- CARB held two webinars for tribes to consider a map of tribal land ownership for business-as-usual land management modeling for the Draft 2022 Scoping Plan Update on October 11, 2021, and October 14, 2021.
- On July 20, 2022, CARB physically mailed letters to all tribes in California asking them for consultation on the Draft 2022 Scoping Plan Update.
- On this same date, CARB emailed all tribal Chairpersons and Chiefs to let them know electronically as well.
- CARB also emailed 500 tribal representatives through its tribal listserv.
- CARB posted the request on its “Tribal Relations” website in the “What’s New” section.
- CARB posted the tribal listening session on twitter.
- CARB also sent the request letter to the following agencies and organizations:
 - Governor’s Office.
 - California Environmental Protection Agency (CalEPA).
 - CalEPA Tribal Advisory Committee.
 - National Tribal Air Association.
 - Native American Heritage Commission.
 - Tribal Chairperson’s Association (including all regional associations).
 - Native American Environmental Protection Coalition.
- CARB held a Tribal Listening Session on the Draft 2022 Scoping Plan Update on August 24, 2022.
- CARB consulted with eight (8) tribes throughout California and added tribal approved language to the Final Scoping Plan, which is located here: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/our-work/programs/ab-32-climate-change-scoping-plan/2022-scoping-plan-documents>.
- CARB mailed and emailed individual letters to all tribes in California notifying them of the release of the Final 2022 Scoping Plan.
- The Final 2022 Scoping Plan was approved at the December 15, 2022, Board hearing.

Priorities for 2023 and Beyond

- CARB will continue to reach out to tribes to better understand their air quality needs, help build tribal air quality programs, and partner with tribes on regulations and plans that tribes may have an interest in providing input into.
- CARB will improve our internal staff capacity to engage with tribes by finishing its training and making it mandatory for all 1,700+ CARB employees.
- CARB will seek out ways to further engage tribes.

Resources

- [CARB Tribal Relations Website](#)
- [Tribal Government Funding](#)
- [Rulemakings](#)
- [Board Meetings](#)